

**Comment Resolution Matrix for Public Review #1 of "Specification for Transfer of OpenC2 Messages via HTTPS Version 1.0"**

Item #	Source	Email Link	Page	Line	Comment Summary	GH Issue Link	Resolution Summary	GH Change Link	Material?
HTTPS-01	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00030.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00030.html</a>	13	40	Serialization should not be limited to JSON	<a href="#">Issue 10</a>	Modify the language so that JSON must be supported but other serializations are not precluded.	<a href="#">PR29</a>	Yes
HTTPS-02	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00031.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00031.html</a>	15	11	HTTP Date header should be optional.	<a href="#">Issue 8</a>	Accepted. Reworded so that this header field is optional IAW RFC 7231, and the exact date format is specified. Multiple locations: p15, lines 11, 15, 19, 53; p16, line 8	<a href="#">PR30</a>	Yes
HTTPS-03	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00032.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00032.html</a>	19	22	Message examples should use example dates rather than a template, to match the other fields in the examples.	<a href="#">Issue 11</a>	Accepted. Altered the example command and response messages to have representative date values rather than a date-time format template. This applies to all example messages in Annex B, i.e., P19, L35; P20, Ls 4, 13, 31, 46, 55.	<a href="#">PR32</a>	No
HTTPS-04	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00033.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00033.html</a>	8	45	Section 1 is missing the Goal material present in the other two specifications	<a href="#">Issue 12</a>	Accepted, included in common Section 1.x content for all three specifications.	<a href="#">PR62</a>	No
HTTPS-05	Paul Knight	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00009.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00009.html</a>	19	6	Referenced "head information" doesn't appear in language specification.	<a href="#">Issue 13</a>	Updated to use "message elements" language, per CSD07/PDR01 of the Language Specification.	<a href="#">PR34</a>	No
HTTPS-06	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	2	7	Change "specification describes" to "document specifies"	<a href="#">Issue 14</a>	Accepted. Change to: "This document specifies the use of HTTP over TLS as a transfer mechanism for OpenC2 messages."	<a href="#">PR33</a>	No
HTTPS-07	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	5	10	Section 1.0: Delete "one or more" regarding selection of transfer specifications.	<a href="#">Issue 15</a>	Withdrawn; replacing 1.0 with common content for all three specification.	<a href="#">PR35</a>	No
HTTPS-08	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	6	21	Section 1.4: Add non-normative references to IACD documents	<a href="#">Issue 16</a>	Accepted. Added IACD papers by Willette and Herring as non-normative references.	<a href="#">PR36</a>	No
HTTPS-09	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	7	17	Section 1.6: Add targets as something an AP may define	<a href="#">Issue 17</a>	Accepted, included in common Section 1.x content for all three specifications.	<a href="#">PR62</a>	No
HTTPS-10	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	7	40	Section 1.6: Clarify explanation of layering of security solutions	<a href="#">Issue 18</a>	Accepted, included in common Section 1.x content for all three specifications.	<a href="#">PR62</a>	No
HTTPS-11	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	8	1	Section 1.6: Remove references to the subcommittees in the figure	<a href="#">Issue 19</a>	Accepted. Update figure to remove SC reverences. Common to all three specifications.	<a href="#">PR62</a>	No
HTTPS-12	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	8	37	Section 1.6: Change "transport" to "transfer"	<a href="#">Issue 20</a>	Accepted: Change "transport" to "transfer" in phrase "as a transport mechanism for"	<a href="#">PR62</a>	No
HTTPS-13	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	8	42-43	Section 1.6: Reword sentence for broader audience	<a href="#">Issue 21</a>	Accepted. Changed to: "This specification provides guidance for selection of TLS versions and options when utilizing HTTPS for OpenC2 message transport." and delete subsequent sentence starting "It includes guidance ...".	<a href="#">PR28</a>	No
HTTPS-14	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	11, 12	1, 1	Remove "JSON" from message lines in Figures 2 and 3	<a href="#">Issue 22</a>	Rejected. No change	<a href="#">PR42</a>	No
HTTPS-15	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	17	10-22	Mix of links and unlinked text in conformance clauses	<a href="#">Issue 23</a>	Accepted. Made all section references in the conformance clause list live links.	<a href="#">PR40</a>	No
HTTPS-16	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	17	35	Add RFC 7231 to Date reference	<a href="#">Issue 24</a>	Accepted. Reworded as "Carried in the HTTP Date header in the preferred IMF-fixdate format as defined by Section 7.1.1.1 of RFC 7231"	<a href="#">PR27</a>	No

**Comment Resolution Matrix for Public Review #1 of "Specification for Transfer of OpenC2 Messages via HTTPS Version 1.0"**

Item #	Source	Email Link	Page	Line	Comment Summary	GH Issue Link	Resolution Summary	GH Change Link	Material?
HTTPS-17	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00003.html</a>	19	43-44	Unmatched brackets in example	<a href="#">Issue 25</a>	Accepted. Added a closing brace to the example response.	<a href="#">PR26</a>	No
HTTPS-18	Duncan Sparell	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00045.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00045.html</a>	21	11	DKS28: ID example in Appendix B	<a href="#">Issue 43</a>	Comment withdrawn. No changes.	<a href="#">PR57</a>	No
HTTPS-19	Duncan Sparell	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00047.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00047.html</a>	13	43	DKS29: Object to "verbose JSON" terminology	<a href="#">Issue 44</a>	Delete word "verbose" in section 3.2.1, and table in 4.1.	<a href="#">Included in PR29</a>	No
HTTPS-20	Duncan Sparell	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00048.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00048.html</a>	13	21	DKS30: transport independent (vis-a-vis command-id / correlation-id)	<a href="#">Issue 45</a>	Comment withdrawn. No changes.	N/A	Yes
HTTPS-21	Duncan Sparell	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00049.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00049.html</a>	13	22	DKS31: Remove notifications	<a href="#">Issue 46</a>	Accepted. Any wording defining or suggesting support for asynchronous notifications has been removed.	<a href="#">PR52</a>	Yes
HTTPS-22	Duncan Sparell	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00050.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00050.html</a>	Mult		DKS32 - command-id	<a href="#">Issue 47</a>	Accepted: Replace "command-id" with "request-id" throughout the document. Related to HTTP-29, both addressed with PR63.	<a href="#">PR63</a>	Yes
HTTPS-23	Duncan Sparell	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00051.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00051.html</a>	Mult		DKS33 - Backwards	<a href="#">Issue 48</a>	Accepted. Removed support for polling (AKA "backwards") and other scenarios where the Producer is the HTTP/TLS listener.	<a href="#">PR61</a>	Yes
HTTPS-24	Duncan Sparell	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00052.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00052.html</a>	Mult		DKS34 - TLS 1.3	<a href="#">Issue 49</a>	Comment withdrawn after confirmation of existing TLS 1.2 implementations during January 2019 face-to-face meeting. No changes.	<a href="#">PR53</a>	Yes
HTTPS-25	OASIS TAB	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201812/msg00002.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201812/msg00002.html</a>	Mult		Set and then use language for distinguishing normative from non-normative content	<a href="#">Issue 50</a>	Labeled sections / subsections / examples explicitly with normative / non-normative indication.	<a href="#">PR56</a>	Yes
HTTPS-26	Duncan Sparell	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00058.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00058.html</a>	Mult		Require mutual authentication (unresolved WD02 issue)	<a href="#">Issue 5</a>	Accepted. Changes will be addressed in concert with HTTPS-27 (PR58). PR59 withdrawn.	<a href="#">PR59</a>	Yes
HTTPS-27	Duncan Sparell	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00058.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00058.html</a>	Mult		Authentication requirements (unresolved WD02 issue)	<a href="#">Issue 6</a>	Accepted. Also addresses HTTPS-26. Changes: * Require mutual authentication without specifying any particular mechanism. * Remove specification of X.509 certificates as the only mutual authentication mechanism. * Consolidate subsections of 4. Conformance	<a href="#">PR58</a>	Yes
HTTPS-28	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00066.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00066.html</a>	Mult		Remove obsolete "id_ref" field from example messages.	<a href="#">Issue 51</a>	Delete id_ref field everywhere it appears in sample messages	<a href="#">PR60</a>	No
HTTPS-29	David Lemire	<a href="https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00069.html">https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00069.html</a>	Mult		Specify encoding for X-Correlation-ID	<a href="#">Issue 54</a>	Overcome by events, due to change in the Language Specification to encode the identifiers as strings. PR55 for base64url encoding had already been merged; PR 63 was created and applied to align with the L-Spec, and make related updates.	<a href="#">PR63</a>	Yes