

Comment Resolution Matrix for Public Review #1 of "Open Command and Control (OpenC2) Profile for Stateless Packet Filtering Version 1.0"

Item #	Source	Email Link	Page	Line	Comment Summary	GH Issue Link	Resolution Summary	Material?	Pull Request	Consensus?	email sent to subcommittee	pinged reviewer
Green=resolved, change accepted. Blue= resolved, OBE or change not accepted, red= unresolved												
SLPF-1	Royer, Phillip	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201811/msg00005.html	31	34	Need to include direction specifier in sample command	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/24	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	No	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/41	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/19/2018	12/27/2018
SLPF-2	Royer, Phillip	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201811/msg00006.html	31	20	include text stating that inclusion of the actuator in the command will instruct the recipient as to which profile (in the case of an actuator supporting multiple profiles)	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/40	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	No	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/42	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	43453	43461
SLPF-3	Brule, Joe	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00002.html	4		Need to generate TOC for MD version	NA	Need OASIS to address	No				
SLPF-4	Brule, Joe	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00022.html	24	19, 40	Compliance language should map to Schema, not tables	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/22	Call for objections to Close issue and Reject Pull Request on Jan 31	Yes	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/43	Yes, Reject Pull Request and close issue per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/19/2018	
SLPF-5	Brule, Joe	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00021.html	15	13-23	Semantics for common arguments should be moved to language spec	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/23	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	Yes	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/44	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/19/2018	
SLPF-6	Stair, Michael	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201811/msg00007.html	14	11-25	Support IP address/ CIDR/Subnets	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/26	Call for objections to Reject Pull Request	Yes	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/67	YES: Pull request #67 was accepted subject to resolution within the LSC NO: Pull request rejected issue remains open per Jan 30 AP-SC	12/27/2018	12/27/2018
SLPF-7	Knight, Paul	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201811/msg00001.html		11	Remove 'this document', was apparent copy/paste from Lang Spec	NA	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	No	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/50	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/26/2018	12/27/2018
SLPF-8	Knight, Paul	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201811/msg00001.html	6	41 +	Many items identified in Normative were not referenced, cross check	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/28	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	No	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/49	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/21/2018	12/27/2018

Comment Resolution Matrix for Public Review #1 of "Open Command and Control (OpenC2) Profile for Stateless Packet Filtering Version 1.0"

Item #	Source	Email Link	Page	Line	Comment Summary	GH Issue Link	Resolution Summary	Material?	Pull Request	Consensus?	email sent to subcommittee	pinged reviewer
Green=resolved, change accepted. Blue= resolved, OBE or change not accepted, red= unresolved												
SLPF-10	Knight, Paul	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201811/msg0001.html	NA	NA	Multiple instances of MD table corruption	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/30	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	No	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/52	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/26/2018	12/27/2018
SLPF-9	Knight, Paul	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201811/msg0001.html	NA	NA	Throughout document, create hyperlinks for cross referencing	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/30	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	No	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/51	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/21/2018	12/27/2018
SLPF-11	Brule, Joe	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201811/msg00020.html	NA	NA	Twenty five administrative comments throughout	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/29	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	No	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/48	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/19/2018	
SLPF-12	TAB	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201812/msg0009.html	24	22	Delete the '(or higher)' clause	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/34	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	no	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/45	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/20/2018	
SLPF-13	TAB	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201812/msg0009.html	23	25-56	Move the traceability matrix to an annex	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/35	Call for objections to Reject Pull Request	no	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/46	YES, Per Feb 13 AP-SC meeting, agreed to remove traceability matrix from profile in version 1.0 NO: Pull request rejected issue remains open per Jan 30 AP-SC	12/20/2018	
SLPF-14	TAB	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201812/msg0009.html	23	6-16	Remove definition list from conformance section	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/36	Call for objections to Reject Pull Request	no	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/46	YES, Per Feb 13 AP-SC, accepted new conformance section that removed the definitions within section 3. NO: Pull request rejected issue remains open per Jan 30 AP-SC	12/20/2018	
SLPF-15	TAB	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201812/msg0009.html	24	49, 50	Reword conformance clauses regarding ip_addr OR ip_connection	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/37	Call for objections to Reject Pull Request	no	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/47	YES: Per Feb 13 AP-SC, new conformance section written that makes this comment OBE NO: Pull request rejected issue remains open per Jan 30 AP-SC	12/20/2018	

Comment Resolution Matrix for Public Review #1 of "Open Command and Control (OpenC2) Profile for Stateless Packet Filtering Version 1.0"

Item #	Source	Email Link	Page	Line	Comment Summary	GH Issue Link	Resolution Summary	Material?	Pull Request	Consensus?	email sent to subcommittee	pinged reviewer
Green=resolved, change accepted. Blue= resolved, OBE or change not accepted, red= unresolved												
SLPF-16	TAB	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201812/msg00009.html	6	41 +	Correct the format of reference section	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/38	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;		https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/49	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/21/2018	
SLPF-17	TAB	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2-comment/201812/msg00009.html	NA	NA	Set and use normative vs non normative language	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/39	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	no	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/53	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/26/2018	
SLPF-18	Sparrell, Duncan	CSD02 ballot comment - need to look up email link	NA	NA	Need a section transport	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/9	Call for objections to close the issue. Front matter addresses.		NA	Yes, Issue closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/26/2018	
SLPF-19	Sparrell, Duncan	CSD02 ballot comment - need to look up email link	NA	NA	JADN as normative	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/10	Call for objections to close the issue. JADN will be moved to post 1.0	yes	NA	Yes, Issue closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/26/2018 (still a mess)	
SLPF-20	Sparrell, Duncan	CSD02 ballot comment - need to look up email link	NA	NA	Update use case	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/11	Call for objections to close this issue. Cisco Use case documented	yes	NA	Yes, Issue closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting	12/26/2018	
SLPF-21	Sparrell, Duncan	CSD02 ballot comment - need to look up email link	NA	NA	Default resposne type shoujld be complete	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/12	Call for objections to close this issue. Current language spec is written as proposed	Yes	NA	Yes, Issue closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meetnig	12/26/2018	
SLPF-22	Sparrell, Duncan	CSD02 ballot comment - need to look up email link	NA	NA	Error responses	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/13	Call for objections to close this issue. Current language spec is written as proposed	no	NA	Yes, Issue closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meetnig	12/26/2018	
SLPF-23	Sparrell, Duncan	CSD02 ballot comment - need to look up email link	NA	NA	Requireing 'Optional' for producers	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/14				YES; Per Feb 13 AP-SC, the comment was accepted. Additoinal conformance criteria defined NO: Pull request rejected issue remains open per Jan 30 AP-SC	12/26/2018	
SLPF-24	Sparrell, Duncan	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00038.html	NA	NA	Profile specification and breadth	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/17					12/26/2018 (still a mess)	
SLPF-25	Sparrell, Duncan	WD03 comment - need to look up ref to email	NA	NA	Conformance to Lang spec	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apscc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/19	Call for objections to close the issue. Address Post 1.0		Conflict with TAB comment	Yes, Issue closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meetnig	12/26/2018	

Comment Resolution Matrix for Public Review #1 of "Open Command and Control (OpenC2) Profile for Stateless Packet Filtering Version 1.0"

Item #	Source	Email Link	Page	Line	Comment Summary	GH Issue Link	Resolution Summary	Material?	Pull Request	Consensus?	email sent to subcommittee	pinged reviewer
Green=resolved, change accepted. Blue= resolved, OBE or change not accepted, red= unresolved												
SLPF-26	Sparrell, Duncan	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00039.html	24	11-ish	Conformance Profile for Options	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/18		Yes	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/66	YES: Per Feb 13 AP-SC, additional conformance criteria defined		
SLPF-27	Sparrell, Duncan	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00040.html	41	34-ish	Acknowledgements	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/59	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	no	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/60	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting		
SLPF-28	Sparrell, Duncan	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00041.html	26	27-ish	Weird JADN Brackets	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/58	Call for objections to close the issue. JADN will be moved to post 1.0	yes	OBE (JADN separate spec)	Yes, Issue closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting		
SLPF-29	Sparrell, Duncan	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00042.html	23	4-ish to 17-ish	Definition in wrong place	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/57		no	OBE			
SLPF-30	Sparrell, Duncan	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00043.html	35	28-ish	toaster is not ideal candidate for an IoT example	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/56	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	no	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/61	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting		
SLPF-31	Sparrell, Duncan	https://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/openc2/201812/msg00044.html	through out		"product" has a specific meaning in OASIS specs and not analogous to 'device, consumer or producer'	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/55	Call for Objections to accept pull request and close issue on Jan 23 and on Jan 31;	no	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/62	Yes, Pull Request accepted and Closed per Jan 30 AP-SC meeting		
SLPF-32	Face to Face	NA	through out	NA	rewrite such that JADN is not referenced in the spec	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/63		yes	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/64	Yes, Per face to face, decision was made to treat JADN as a separate specification and PR #64 addressed		
SLPF-33	Post F2F	NA	NA	NA	Remove ip_addr from target space	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/65		Yes		YES, Per Feb 13 AP-SC, determined that it was not practical to support the use cases with ip_connection target only		
SLPF-34	Post F2F	NA	NA	NA	Need to add ICMP target	https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/issues/69			https://github.com/oasis-tcs/openc2-apsc-stateless-packet-filter/pull/71			