Document Metadata:

Owner: ebxml-bp (OASIS ebXML Business Process TC)

Product: ebxmlbp (aka ebBP)

Product Version: 2.0.3 (against 2.0.2)

Artifact Type: Document

Stage: cd (15-day Public Review for v2.02 to move to v2.0.3)

Descriptive Name: PublicReviewComments

Revision: None

Language: en (English)

Form: .sxc (Star Office) or .pdf (PostScript)

Date: 20060324 (24 March 2006)

ID	Submitter (name and email address)	Submission Date	Submitted To (Email list)	Issue Type	Issue	Link to Original Message	Specification Type	Specification Reference
format: spec version-comment version-comment id, such as wd-06-01 (working draft-06-comment 01)								
cd-2-0-2-01	Stephen Green	8. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Editorial (non-substantive)	Image links in the technical specification	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00000.html	v2.0.2 cd: All images (.html version) in technical specification and/or appendices.	Closed
cd-2-0-2-02	Monica J. Martin	8. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Editorial	Add a statement similar to this in introductory sections as suggested by the ebxml-jc. Section 2.3 is a candidate to place this text. "The ebXML framework has been composed of several independent, but related or aligned, components. Specifications for each component can be used individually, composed as desired, or integrated with other evolving technologies."	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00001.html	v2.0.2 cd: Section 2.3 in technical specification.	Closed
cd-2-0-2-03	Monica J. Martin	8. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Editorial	Update BPMN diagrams per discussions with OMG BPMN FTF group. These diagrams were updated during the public review and additional suggestions have been provided by this BPMN team. As the diagrams are non-normative examples, this update is non-substantive.	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00002.html	v2.0.2 cd: Figures, 7 and 8 in technical specification.	Closed
cd-2-0-2-04	Radha Arur	20. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Open	Though the distinction and the dependencies between BSInterface and MSInterface are defined, it is not clearly specified (though suggested) how the MSI can be used without BSI. i.e Does the BSI remain redundant in that situation?	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00003.html	See sections for tech spec in resolution.	Closed
cd-2-0-2-05	Radha Arur	20. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Open	Relation with other specification – i.e how the CPA and CVV should interact with CQI – Customer Information Quality TC recommended work?	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00003.html	Future white paper	Closed
cd-2-0-2-06	Radha Arur	20. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Open	CPA actually specifies the interface with access points defined by the business process specification. Elaboration / clarification on this sentence? Does it mean BSI is CPA?	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00003.html	See sections for tech spec in resolution.	Closed
cd-2-0-2-07	Radha Arur	20. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Open	Rules for the Collaboration Monitoring engine is left too much to the discretion of the application and has not specified any framework or guideline and may also take input how this interacts with F2F activity. i.e How the messaging and collaboration layer work together is not specified or not easily tracable.	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00003.html	Future white paper	Closed

Documented Public Review Comments on v2.0.2 to be considered in v2.0.3 Committee Draft.

ID	Submitter (name and email address)	Submission Date	Submitted To (Email list)	Issue Type	Issue	Link to Original Message	Specification Type	Specification Reference
cd-2-0-2-08	Radha Arur	20. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Open	Distinction between Business message and signal and the relation with BSI may be explicitly mentioned.	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00003.html	See sections for tech spec in resolution.	Closed
cd-2-0-2-09	Radha Arur	20. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Open	The difference between Substantive business message and normal business message since both refers to the same in many situations.	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00003.html	See sections for tech spec in resolution.	Closed
cd-2-0-2-10	Radha Arur	20. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Open	Explanation of Relevance of state synchronization and state alignment may need to be mentioned.	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00003.html	See sections for tech spec in resolution.	Closed
cd-2-0-2-11	Radha Arur	20. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Open	Relationship to repository is very much at abstract level. May/ should provide a better implementation recommendation.	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00003.html	Future white paper	Closed
cd-2-0-2-12	Radha Arur	20. Feb. 2006	Public Comment list	Open	A sample implementation on how the specification can be used between applications in the organization (especially for a complex business transaction) with the use of Fork, Decision and Joint Gateway will be really useful.	http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00003.html	See references to public web site examples.	Closed

Key:

Key:	Comment types
Open	General comment
Complete	Editorial
v3.0 Reassessr	FAQ
Not applicable	Work item related
Pending closure	Technical
Closed	

Documented Public Review Comments on v2.0.2 to be considered in v2.0.3 Committee Draft.

Resolution	TC Discussion	Disposition	Comments	Owner	Status
Correct the underlying source code for the generated .html. Will be provided when updated packages are distributed.	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb and formally 7 March 2006. 28. Feb. 2006: Descriptive text acceptable.	Done	Martin	Integrated into wd-01 for v2.0.3 ballots.
Update as specified in initial comment. See: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00001.html	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb and formally 7 March 2006. 28. Feb. 2006: Descriptive text acceptable.	Done	Martin	Integrated into wd-01 for v2.0.3.
Updates proposed and coordinated with BPMN team (including formal FTF comments). See: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200602/msg00031.htmlAdditional comments to BPMN FTF: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200602/msg00029.htmlAdded new descriptive text to coincide with diagram updates: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200603/msg00003.html	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb on diagram changes and formally 7 March 2006 for diagram and descriptive text changes. 28. Feb. 2006: Descriptive text acceptable.	Done	Martin	Integrated into wd-01 for v2.0.3.
Initial responses 21. Feb. 2006: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00004.html This could be handled outside of the technical specification in a white paper and Arur agreed. See: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200602/msg00055.html	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb and formally 7 March 2006. 28. Feb. 2006: Overall approach approved.	Future white paper	Martin	No changes to wd-01 for v2.0.3.
Initial responses 21. Feb. 2006: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00004.html Referred to CPPA team and additional response to Arur. No changes recommended. See: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200602/msg00051.html	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb and formally 7 March 2006. 28. Feb. 2006: Overall approach approved.	Future white paper and/or referral to CPA team.	Martin	No changes to wd-01 for v2.0.3.
Initial responses 21. Feb. 2006: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00004.html Additional details provided to Arur with descriptive changes proposed. See: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200602/msg00052.html. Also referred to CPPA team.	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb and formally 7 March 2006. 28. Feb. 2006: Descriptive text acceptable and overall approach approved.	Done	Martin	Integrated into wd-01 for v2.0.3.
Initial responses 21. Feb. 2006: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00004.html This could be handled outside of the technical specification in a white paper and Arur agreed. See: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200602/msg00055.html	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb and formally 7 March 2006. 28. Feb. 2006: Approach appoved.	Future white paper	Martin	No changes to wd-01 for v2.0.3.

Documented Public Review Comments on v2.0.2 to be considered in v2.0.3 Committee Draft.

Resolution	TC Discussion	Disposition	Comments	Owner	Status
Initial responses 21. Feb. 2006: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00004.html Additional details provided to Arur with descriptive changes proposed. See: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200602/msg00053.html	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb and formally 7 March 2006. 28. Feb. 2006: Descriptive text acceptable.	Done	Martin	Integrated into wd-01 for v2.0.3.
Initial responses 21. Feb. 2006: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00004.html Additional details provided to Arur with descriptive changes proposed. See: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200602/msg00054.html	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb and formally 7 March 2006. 28. Feb. 2006: Descriptive text acceptable.	Done	Martin	Integrated into wd-01 for v2.0.3.
Initial responses 21. Feb. 2006: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00004.html Additional details provided to Arur with descriptive changes proposed. See: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200602/msg00053.htmlAdd descriptive text related to Figure 14 and 15: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200603/msg00002.html	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb and formally 7 March 2006. 28. Feb. 2006: Descriptive text acceptable.	Done	Martin	Integrated into wd-01 for v2.0.3.
Initial responses 21. Feb. 2006: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00004.html This could be handled outside of the technical specification in a white paper and Arur agreed. See: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200602/msg00055.html	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb and formally 7 March 2006. 28. Feb. 2006: Approach appoved.	Future white paper	Martin	No changes to wd-01 for v2.0.3.
Initial responses 21. Feb. 2006: http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/ebxml-bp-comment/200602/msg00004.html This could be handled outside of the technical specification in a white paper and Arur agreed through examples. See: http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/ebxml-bp/email/archives/200602/msg00055.html	7. March. 2006	Approved in discussion 28 Feb and formally 7 March 2006. 28. Feb. 2006: Approach appoved.	Future white paper	Martin	No changes to wd-01 for v2.0.3.

Documented Public Review Comments on v2.0.2 to be considered in v2.0.3 Committee Draft.