[OBIX-187] Redirects (7) Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 06/Nov/14 Resolved: 06/Nov/14

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	SOAP PR02
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Minor
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Resolution:	I don't see any problem here. I think it is better to use the non-https links by default. Further, http://www.unc.edu/ seems to be the more official URL. If the request is redirected later by the organization it is not really a problem.

Description

"The link checker at: http://validator.w3.org/checklink, reports seven (7) redirects in the current draft.

Line: 911 http://www.oasis-open.org/ redirected to https://www.oasis-open.org/
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

warning Lines: 739, 819 http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/obix/ redirected to https://www.oasis-open.org/committees/obix/
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

warning Line: 816 http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/comments/index.php?wg_abbrev=obix redirected to https://www.oasis-open.org/committees/comments/index.php?wg_abbrev=obix
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

warning Line: 916 http://www.oasis-open.org/policies-guidelines/trademark redirected to https://www.oasis-open.org/policies-guidelines/trademark
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

warning Line: 825 http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/obix/ipr.php redirected to https://www.oasis-open.org/committees/obix/ipr.php
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

warning Line: 746 http://www.unc.edu/ redirected to http://unc.edu/
Status: 301 -> 200 OK

warning Line: 855 http://www.oasis-open.org/policies-guidelines/ipr redirected to https://www.oasis-open.org/policies-guidelines/ipr
Status: 301 -> 200 OK
"

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [05/Mar/14]

I don't see any problem here. I think it is better to use the non-https links by default.

Further, http://www.unc.edu/ seems to be the more official URL. If the request is redirected later by the organization it is not really a problem.

[OBIX-128] 1.2 Normative References Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 06/Nov/14 Resolved: 06/Nov/14

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	SOAP PR02
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Minor
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Resolution:	Changed reference. Fixed in WD10

Description

"1.2 Normative References reads in part:

*****
SOAP M Gudgin, M Hadley, N Mendelsohn, J Moreau, H Nielsen, A Karmarkar, Y Lafon, W3C SOAP Version 1.2 (Second Edition), W3C Recommendation 27 April 2007
*****

SOAP is a multi-part standard and the citation given isn't clear if all or part of the SOAP standard is being cited as a normative reference.

The correct citation for SOAP Version 1.2 Part 0: (Second Edition) reads:

*****
SOAP12-PART0
SOAP Version 1.2 Part 0: Primer (Second Edition) , N. Mitra, Y. Lafon, Editors, W3C Recommendation, 27 April 2007, http://www.w3.org/TR/2007/REC-soap12-part0-20070427/ . Latest version available at http://www.w3.org/TR/soap12-part0/ .
*****

As per the W3C bibliography generator: http://www.w3.org/2002/01/tr-automation/tr-biblio-ui"

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [05/Mar/14]
Changed reference. Fixed in WD10

[OBIX-127] 1.3 Normative References - delete its empty Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 06/Nov/14 Resolved: 06/Nov/14

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	SOAP PR02
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Minor

Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Resolution:	Removed non-normative references section. Fixed in WD 10.

Description

1.3 Non-Normative References is empty

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [05/Mar/14]

Removed non-normative references section.

Comment by Markus Jung [05/Mar/14]

Fixed in WD 10.

[OBIX-126] 1.2 Normative References - SOAP not cited Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 11/Nov/14 Resolved: 11/Nov/14

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	SOAP PR02
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Applied		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

"After a close reading of the text, it appears that there are no normative references invoking any part or section of the SOAP standards group.

Therefore, whatever was meant by the citation is irrelevant since it isn't used in the document.

Delete the SOAP reference and/or repair the text to cite some portion of the SOAP specifications normatively."

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [05/Mar/14]

There is a normative reference to SOAP.

SOAP SOAP Version 1.2 Part 0: Primer (Second Edition) , N. Mitra, Y. Lafon, Editors, W3C Recommendation, 27 April 2007, http://www.w3.org/TR/2007/REC-soap12-part0-20070427/ . Latest version available at http://www.w3.org/TR/soap12-part0/

[OBIX-125] 3. Conformance - violates TC process Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 06/Nov/14 Resolved: 06/Nov/14

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	SOAP PR02
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	**Priority:**	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	**Assignee:**	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Resolution:	The new conformance section is now reformated to use a numbered list.

Description

"3. Conformance reads:

*****
An implementation is compliant with this specification if it implements all MUST or REQUIRED level requirements.
*****

The TC Process requires:

*****
8(a) - must include a separate section, listing a set of numbered conformance clauses, to which any implementation of the specification must adhere in order to claim conformance to the specification (or any optional portion thereof).
*****

There are no numbered clauses nor is there any accounting for interaction of clients and servers that follow ""SHOULD"" statements in this draft.
"

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [05/Mar/14]

The new conformance section is now reformated to use a numbered list.

[OBIX-124] 3. Conformance - null and void Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 06/Nov/14 Resolved: 06/Nov/14

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	SOAP PR02
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	**Priority:**	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	**Assignee:**	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

| Resolution: | Removed the statement and changed it to:

"To be compliant with this specification an OBIX server MUST provide an SOAP interface accoding to the WSDL document that is provided as additional artifact to this specification. An OBIX client that uses SOAP to interact with the server MUST use the SOAP message definition according to the types defined in the WSDL file and the referenced OBIX core schema."

Fixed in WD10 |
|---|---|

Description

"3. Conformance reads:

*****
An implementation is compliant with this specification if it implements all MUST or REQUIRED level requirements.
*****

There are no, repeat no, MUST or REQUIRED level requirements in this draft. Not even one.

"

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [05/Mar/14]

Removed the statement and changed it to:

"To be compliant with this specification an OBIX server MUST provide an SOAP interface accoding to the WSDL document that is provided as additional artifact to this specification. An OBIX client that uses SOAP to interact with the server MUST use the SOAP message definition according to the types defined in the WSDL file and the referenced OBIX core schema."

Fixed in WD10

[OBIX-123] WSDL schema error Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 06/Nov/14 Resolved: 06/Nov/14

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	SOAP PR02
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

"The file name of the WSDL file is obix-soap-v1.wsdl.

The schema document reports:

schemaLocation=""./obix.xsd

Attempts to validate the WSDL file with a 404 on the schema location.

All separate computer files are required to be valid by the TC process.

"

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [03/Mar/14]

The name of the file is obix-v1.1.xsd. I changed it now. The given wsdl assumes that the schema resides in the same relative directory.

Comment by Markus Jung [05/Mar/14]

The schemaLocation is removed from the example given in the specification and changed in the .wsdl file.

Comment by Markus Jung [06/Nov/14]

The name of the file is obix-v1.1.xsd. I changed it now. The given wsdl assumes that the schema resides in the same relative directory.

The schemaLocation is removed from the example given in the specification and changed in the .wsdl file.

[OBIX-122] WSDL schema error - cannot resolve obix:obj Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 06/Nov/14 Resolved: 06/Nov/14

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	SOAP PR02
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	**Priority:**	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	**Assignee:**	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Resolution:	I think the problem here was that there were slightly different namespace definitions used in the .wsdl and .xsd file for the public review. In the next WD artifacts of the files the problem will be resolved.

Description

"After doing an ad-hoc correction of the file name, attempts to validate the WSDL schema resulted in this error:

*****
Description: Could not solve name 'obj' from namespace {http://docs.oasis-open.org/obix/schema/1.1} to a defined schema element.
*****

Since the first global element in obix-v1.1.xsd is ""obj"", this is a path error but I did not run it to ground."

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [05/Mar/14]

I think the problem here was that there were slightly different namespace definitions used in the .wsdl and .xsd file for the public review. In the next WD artifacts of the files the problem will be resolved.

[OBIX-108] Hanging paragraphs (2 cases) Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 17/Nov/14 Resolved: 17/Nov/14

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	SOAP PR02
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Minor
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Description

"There are several hanging paragraphs, that is where a header occurs followed immediately by content. Which means if I cite ""2 Soap Binding"", do I mean all of chapter 2 or do I just mean the text that immediately follows that heading?

There are two (2) hanging paragraphs in this draft."

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [05/Mar/14]

I don't see the issue. Line numbers would be nice to reference exactly the problem.

[OBIX-102] Normative vs. non-normative text? Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 06/Nov/14 Resolved: 06/Nov/14

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	SOAP PR02
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Resolution:	Added a statement in the introduction of the document, that the given examples in the spec are non-normative but the referenced additional artifacts acts as a normative guide for an implementation.

Description

"This draft contains no statement to guide the reader in distinguishing normative from non-normative text.

Are the examples in 2.1 Example normative?

What is or is not an example in 2.5 WSDL and what of any of that section is normative?"

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [06/Mar/14]

Added a statement in the introduction of the document, that the given examples in the spec are non-normative but the referenced additional artifacts acts as a normative guide for an implementation.

[OBIX-88] Conformance clause inadequate in SOAP binding Created: 20/Feb/14 Updated: 06/Nov/14 Resolved: 06/Nov/14

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	OBIX 1.1 XSD PR02
Fix Version/s:	SOAP PR02

Type:	Improvement	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	TAB Review		

Resolution:	See related JIRA issue. Conformance clause is updated in WD 10.

Description

Because this is a separate specification on its own a detailed conformance clause is needed.
But this will not do:
"An implementation is compliant with this specification if it implements all MUST or REQUIRED level requirements."
1. "implementation" is not defined or characterized. Server? Request? both?
2. A reference to where are these MUST and REQUIRED found is needed, even if high level.

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [05/Mar/14]

See related JIRA issue. Conformance clause is updated in WD 10.

[OBIX-56] Editorial: Tables and Figures need to be identified, have separate tables of... in the front matter Created: 12/Sep/13 Updated: 16/Dec/13 Resolved: 16/Dec/13

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	ENCODINGS Specification, OBIX 1.1 Specification, REST Specification, SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	oBIX 1.1 PR01, SOAP PR01, ENCODINGS PR01, REST PR01
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	William Cox	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	William Cox		

Resolution:	Number the tables and figures. Create a table of figures and table of tables (!) after the Table of Contents for each specification.

Description

See e.g. OBIX 1.1 PR01, starting at lines 270, 1522, 1890. Tables should have a numbered caption via insert caption; figures likewise. Suggest sequential numbering through the document.

Comments

Comment by Craig Gemmill [27/Sep/13]

For the 1.1 spec, this is a duplicate of OBIX-31. So I'll work the 1.1 core spec there.

Noted that reporter here suggests sequential numbering. In OBIX-31, the suggestion is (per other recent specs) <chapter>-<number> for both Figures and Tables. Plan is to go with the latter approach for consistency.

Comment by Markus Jung [02/Oct/13]

Fixed for ENCODINGS in OBIX-Encodings-v1.0-wd07.

Comment by Craig Gemmill [16/Oct/13]

Fixed for core spec in WD16.

Comment by Markus Jung [07/Nov/13]

In the SOAP binding document are no figures and no tables.

Comment by Markus Jung [07/Nov/13]

Table of Tables added to the Encodings document WD 08.

[OBIX-55] Localization Created: 09/Sep/13 Updated: 16/Dec/13 Resolved: 16/Dec/13

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	oBIX 1.1 PR01
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Improvement	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Toby Considine
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	Toby Considine		

Description

We should limit chained references. If the Localization from REST is moved into Encodings or into the core 1.1 (best), Then the SOAP binding would no longer need to make normative references to the REST Binding, which would simplify the document set and conformance.

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [07/Nov/13]

I think in this case it could not be avoided, since the localization relies on the HTTP header variable. It would be possible to duplicate the according section from the REST document, but duplicating information is always a bad idea. In this case I would keep the reference.

[OBIX-54] SOAP: XML Namespaces in examples Created: 09/Sep/13 Updated: 16/Dec/13 Resolved: 16/Dec/13

Status:	Resolved

Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	oBIX 1.1 PR01
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Minor
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	Toby Considine		

Proposal:	This section should be removed or updated to not mandate possible collisions with other specifications. For example, If at a future date, A system supports oBIX 1.2 with an XML Encoding and a REST Binding, this section would seem to require that SOAP indicate a 1.1 namespace... Alternately, this section should indicate that the examples are non-normative, and use 1.1 for clarity.

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [07/Nov/13]

For the WSDL it is important to provide the version within the namespace, so a client can distinguish between different versions.

I think this topic should be discussed, how to handle future version releases and how the the bindings and encodings can evolve in an independent way.

[OBIX-53] SOAP - Namespaces throughout document Created: 09/Sep/13 Updated: 16/Dec/13 Resolved: 16/Dec/13

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	oBIX 1.1 PR01
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	Toby Considine		

Description

All examples are inconsistent with the rules on prefixes described Section 2.3 (XML Encoding) of the Common Encodings document. It may be that those rules (in encodings) are incorrect. This bears some group discussion.

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [07/Nov/13]

The namespace rules regarding the prefix are modified in the encodings document WD08. Now it should be fine.

[OBIX-52] SOAP: Simple editorial issues Created: 09/Sep/13 Updated: 16/Dec/13 Resolved: 16/Dec/13

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	oBIX 1.1 PR01
Fix Version/s:	None

Type:	Improvement	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Toby Considine	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		
Environment:	Toby Considine		

Description

Update namespaces on title page

Remove extra lines between paragraphs

Lines 33-35: Update namespaces in example

78-199: If the WSDL is intended to be normative, then it should be placed in a separate artifact. It is OK to include it w/I the document for ease of reading, but if so, it should be noted that the machine readable artifact is normative

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [07/Nov/13]

Fixed in working draft 6:

-) Namespaces could be changed to:

http://docs.oasis-open.org/obix/wsdl/1.1
http://docs.oasis-open.org/obix/schema/1.1

Needs a discussion.

-) Extra lines between paragraphs removed

-) WSDL is also provided as separate normative artifact and listed within the additional artifacts section

[OBIX-29] Code example format Created: 05/Sep/13 Updated: 13/Dec/13 Resolved: 13/Dec/13

Status:	Resolved
Project:	OASIS Open Building Information Exchange (oBIX) TC
Component/s:	SOAP Specification
Affects Version/s:	oBIX 1.1 PR01
Fix Version/s:	SOAP WD06

Type:	Bug	Priority:	Major
Reporter:	Markus Jung	Assignee:	Markus Jung
Resolution:	Fixed		
Labels:	None		

Environment:	Markus Jung

Description

SOAP binding document - line 37:
Formatting should be changed to code example.

Comments

Comment by Markus Jung [07/Nov/13]

Fixed in WD06

Generated at Mon Nov 17 17:01:59 UTC 2014 by Toby Considine using JIRA 6.2.2#6258-sha1:201243328db078df3cab7b27765d24a31aae57c8.