

| Topic                                                              | Description of change                                                                                                                                                           | Author or editor | Reference to review comment |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------|-----------------------------|
| 2.1.1.1 About the specification source                             | Added <p> acknowledging XSL-FO software used to generate PDFs                                                                                                                   | Eberlein         | None                        |
| 2.1.2.2.4 DITA map attributes                                      | Modified description of @locktitle attribute to improve clarity                                                                                                                 | Yeo              |                             |
| 2.1.3.4.3.3 Processing key references                              | Added @processing-role to list of attributes that do not propagate from keydef to keyref per discussion with Tarun Garg                                                         | Kimber           | C024                        |
| 2.1.3.4.3.4 Examples of keys                                       | Corrected "mapgroup" to "mapgroup-d" in examples                                                                                                                                | Kimber           |                             |
| 2.1.3.6 Conditional processing (profiling)                         | Clarified use of the @rev attribute                                                                                                                                             | Eberlein         | C02                         |
| 2.1.3.6 Conditional processing (profiling)                         | Updated content to reflect fact that processors may treat @otherprops the same as @props but do not need to.                                                                    | Kimber           | C032                        |
| 2.1.3.9.1 The @xml:lang attribute                                  | Updated following discussion on TC list in threads "Clarification needed on whether xml:lang is required" and "Cascading of xml:lang attribute"; removed a stray quotation mark | Yeo              |                             |
| 2.1.4.2 Configuration (Document type shells)                       | Added "coding requirements" terminology                                                                                                                                         | Kimber           | C017                        |
| 2.1.4.3 Specialization                                             | Incorporated missing content on attribute specialization from 1.1 spec.                                                                                                         | Kimber           | C036                        |
| 2.1.4.3.4 Domain usage declaration (the @domains attribute)        | Consolidated syntax details of @domain specifications into domains attribute topic. Replaced redundant text with xref to that topic.                                            | Kimber           | C018                        |
| 2.1.4.3.8.1.5 Attribute domain module coding requirements          | Consolidated syntax details of @domain specifications into domains attribute topic. Replaced redundant text with xref to that topic.                                            | Kimber           | C018                        |
| 2.1.4.3.8.2.1 General element type declaration coding requirements | Made distinction between XSD files for domains and XSD files for structural modules more obvious by reordering the wording.                                                     | Kimber           | C028                        |
| 2.1.4.3.8.2.3 Attribute domain coding requirements                 | Consolidated syntax details of @domain specifications into domains attribute topic. Replaced redundant text with xref to that topic.                                            | Kimber           | C018                        |
| 2.1.4.4.2 Constraint module XSD coding requirements                | Modified content in "Requirements for constraint definition modules" section                                                                                                    | Kimber           | C020, C021                  |
| 3.1.2.2.5 topichead                                                | Added @copy-to to topichead                                                                                                                                                     | Anderson         | C016                        |
| 4 Conformance                                                      | Corrected usage of "key words" and added quotation marks                                                                                                                        | Eberlein         | D030                        |
| Appendix A Acknowledgments                                         | Corrected Kris Eberlein's company affiliation                                                                                                                                   | Anderson         | None                        |
| B.7 DTD organization                                               | Clarify meaning of 1.x in DTD and Schema identifiers                                                                                                                            | Anderson         | C036                        |
| B.8 XML schema organization                                        | Clarify meaning of 1.x in DTD and Schema identifiers                                                                                                                            | Anderson         | C036                        |

## Comments from the public review of DITA 1.2, 7 July 2010 - 5 September 2010

This page contains information about the comments received on the dita-comment and DITA TC e-mail lists during the 60-day public review of DITA 1.2.

**Important:** [Eberlein, 31 August 2010] If you modify a DITA file in response to one of this comments, be sure and use a @rev attribute with a value of "public-review-1".

- ✓ = Completed
- 🟢 = In progress
- 🟡 = Not yet addressed

| #    | Date         | Person            | Subject                                                                       | Link to comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Assigned to                                      | Disposition                          | Action                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Notes                                                                                                                                                   |
|------|--------------|-------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| C001 | 10 July 2010 | Su-Laine Yeo      | FW: Unaddressed comments from Tech Review 3                                   | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00000.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00000.html</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | John Hunt                                        | ✓                                    | Posted responses to all of the comments.                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                         |
| C002 | 15 July 2010 | Su-Laine Yeo      | Conditional processing with the @rev attribute                                | <a href="http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/dita/email/archives/201007/msg00035.html">http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/dita/email/archives/201007/msg00035.html</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Eberlein                                         | ✓                                    | Work completed; see <a href="http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/dita/email/archives/201008/msg00163.html">http://www.oasis-open.org/apps/org/workgroup/dita/email/archives/201008/msg00163.html</a> |                                                                                                                                                         |
| C003 | 15 July 2010 | Su-Laine Yeo      | Broken <mapref> in learningTraining elements.ditamap                          | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00001.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00001.html</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | John Hunt                                        | ✓                                    | The target file in question, keys-learningTraining.ditamap, is in the source tree, so I assume this issue is now resolved.                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                         |
| C004 | 15 July 2010 | Su-Laine Yeo      | Issues with DITA 1.2 CD03: Obsolete file and broken cross-references          | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00002.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00002.html</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Seth Park, Robert Anderson, Kris (obsolete file) | Obsolete file: ✓<br>Broken <xref>: ✓ | Obsolete file, see <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00005.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00005.html</a>                                | [Eberlein, 24 Aug] Broken <xref> is a problem with the PDF processing                                                                                   |
| C005 | 19 July 2010 | Su-Laine Yeo      | MSXML parser and XSDs                                                         | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00003.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00003.html</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Eric Sirois                                      | ✓                                    | Working on a fix.                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                         |
| C006 | 21 July 2010 | Tarun Garg        | @conkeyref resolution using <topicmeta> of key definition                     | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201007/msg00076.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201007/msg00076.html</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Robert, Eliot                                    | ✓                                    | Comment is correct. Updated this section of the topic to remove reference to @conkeyref.                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                         |
| C007 | 21 July 2010 | Toshihiko Makita  | About the range of indexterm written in topic/prolog/metadata                 | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00010.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00010.html</a><br>More at <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00010.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00010.html</a> and (direct pointer to the relevant text in the spec) <a href="http://docs.oasis-open.org/dita/v1.2/cd03/spec/langref/indexterm.html">http://docs.oasis-open.org/dita/v1.2/cd03/spec/langref/indexterm.html</a> | Robert                                           | ✓                                    | Robert sent explanation to the comment list.                                                                                                                                                                  | Michael Priestley heavily involved in this design; if considering a change, wait to discuss until he returns week of 8/23.                              |
| C008 | 21 July 2010 | Johannes Graubner | DITA 1.2 <hazardstatement> <messagepanel>                                     | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00012.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00012.html</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Don--follow up with member of that SC            | (./)                                 | contacted: <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201009/msg00012.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201009/msg00012.html</a>                                        | The commenter is satisfied that the design meets ANSI objectives.                                                                                       |
| C009 | 21 July 2010 | Johannes Graubner | <hazardstatement> and <note>                                                  | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00011.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00011.html</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Chris Kravogel, JoAnn                            | ✓                                    | This note was regarding an OASIS DITA Adoption TC feature article. It does not apply to the DITA 1.2 Specification. I responded to Johannes with an email.                                                    |                                                                                                                                                         |
| C010 | 21 July 2010 | Nakshatra Bhardwa | DITA1.2: Query on <desc> element's content in a key referencing<link> element | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00013.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00013.html</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Robert, Eliot                                    | ✓                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Eliot pointed to the definition in the spec                                                                                                             |
| C011 | 22 July 2010 | Nakshatra Bhardwa | Query on key referencing element's @processing-role                           | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00016.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201007/msg00016.html</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Eliot                                            | ✓                                    | Sent response to Nakshatra agreeing that @processing-role should not propagate from key definitions to key references.                                                                                        | Have a related question on the language in section 2.1.3.4.3.3 Processing key references about attributes on key definitions taking precedence over key |

|      |                          |               |                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                          |   |                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|------|--------------------------|---------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------|---|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|      |                          |               |                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                          |   |                                                                       | references. Have sent note to MP.                                                                                                                                                                         |
| C012 | 28 July 2010             | Tarun Garg    | (TC) Attributes for topicrefs that use @keyref                                                     | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201007/msg00088.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201007/msg00088.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Robert                                   | ✓ |                                                                       | Clarified intent in response to list, awaiting any more comment                                                                                                                                           |
| C013 | 28 July 2010             | Tarun Garg    | (TC) @keys in <mapref>                                                                             | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201007/msg00089.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201007/msg00089.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Robert                                   | ✓ | Fixed mapref topic in lang spec to include @keys                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| C014 | 28 July 2010             | Tarun Garg    | (TC) @keys in <topicsetref>                                                                        | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201007/msg00090.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201007/msg00090.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Kris (completed by Robert)               | ✓ |                                                                       | Clarified intent in response to list, awaiting any more comment                                                                                                                                           |
| C015 | 10 August 2010           | Tarun Garg    | (TC) @processing-role cascade for nested topicrefs                                                 | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00048.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00048.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Eliot                                    | ✓ |                                                                       | Sent response to Tarun to the effect that @processing-role behaves like @toc and explicit values of "normal" override ancestor values of "resource-only". Requires correction to 2.1.3.2 per my response. |
| C016 | 11 August 2010           | Eliot Kimber  | (TC) Bug in mapGroup: copy-to not allowed on topichead                                             | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00054.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00054.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Robert and Eric (DTDs and Schemas)       | ✓ | Need to update DTDs and Schemas                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| C017 | 12 August 2010           | Eliot Kimber  | (TC) Spec Comment: Editorial                                                                       | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00062.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00062.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Eliot                                    | ✓ |                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| C018 | 12 August 2010           | Eliot Kimber  | (TC) Review Comment: General: @domains details scattered/underspecified                            | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00063.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00063.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Eliot                                    | ✓ | Reworked spec per comment                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| C019 | 12 August 2010           | Doug Morrison | (TC) Thoughts on topicgroup, navtitle, and locktitle                                               | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00064.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00064.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Robert                                   | ✓ | No change to spec - keeping wording that appears in draft.            | 1 Sep update from Eliot: <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00004.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00004.html</a>                                      |
| C020 | 16 August 2010           | Eliot Kimber  | (TC) 2.1.4.4.2 Constraint module XSD codingrequirements: Error in example                          | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00066.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00066.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Eliot                                    | ✓ | Eliot to provide example; confirm testing with Sirois                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| C021 | 16 August 2010           | Eliot Kimber  | (TC) 2.1.4.4.2 Constraint module XSD coding requirements:Clarify coding detail                     | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00067.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00067.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Eliot                                    | ✓ | Eliot to add note of explanation                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| C022 | 17 August 2010           | Su-Laine Yeo  | content outcomes of "cascading xml:lang attribute"                                                 | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00007.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00007.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | JoAnn (for DATC), Su-Laine (for rewrite) | ✓ | Read the revision once the docs are re-processed after Public Review. |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| C023 | 23 August 2010           | Tarun Garg    | (TC) Resource-only topicref referred through Reltable                                              | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00077.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00077.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | David                                    | ✓ | David clarified with Tarun.                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| C024 | 24 August 2010           | Eliot Kimber  | (TC) 2.1.3.4.3.3 Processing key references: Remove para starting "When attributes are combined..." | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00082.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00082.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Eliot                                    | ✓ | Michael P concurs; watch for update.                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| C025 | 25 August 2010           | Tarun Garg    | (TC) Href in image correction                                                                      | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00108.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00108.html</a> , <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201008/msg00008.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201008/msg00008.html</a> | Robert                                   | ✓ | Corrected spec topic to list @href as optional                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| C026 | <sup>x</sup> August 2010 | Tarun Garg    | (TC) Propagating Attribute Values                                                                  | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00097.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00097.html</a>                                                                                                                                                               | Eliot                                    | ✓ | Responded on DITA mailing list                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |

|      |                |                 |                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                             |                |   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                           |
|------|----------------|-----------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|---|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------|
| C027 | 26 August 2010 | Don Day         | (TC) OASIS-internal form of link in Acronyms topic                                                         | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201008/msg00009.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201008/msg00009.html</a> | Robert         | ✓ | Corrected link                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                           |
| C028 | 29 August 2010 | Eliot Kimber    | XSD Specialization Coding Requirements: Need to clarify organization of components into *Mod.xsd, *Grp.xsd | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201008/msg00011.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201008/msg00011.html</a> | Eliot, Sirois? | ✓ | Updated spec per comment.                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                           |
| C029 | 30 August 2010 | Jeremy Griffith | linktext content model                                                                                     | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201008/msg00013.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201008/msg00013.html</a> | Robert         | ✓ | Robert's investigation: <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00023.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00023.html</a> ; Gershon will send task for socializing the decided-on impacts to the Adoption TC | Need to update DTD, Schema, Language spec |
| C030 | 30 August 2010 | Doug Morrison   | (TC) DITA 1.2 Review: Conformance section should have listed key words in quotes                           | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00158.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201008/msg00158.html</a>                 | Eberlein       | ✓ | Updated files in SVN; replied to Doug Morrison                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                           |
| C031 | 1 Sept 2010    | Tarun Garg      | (TC) @keys in a conref                                                                                     | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00001.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00001.html</a>                 | Eliot          | ✓ | Response sent by WEK 1 Sept 2010                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                           |
| C032 | 7 Sept 2010    | Eliot           | (TC) Clarify requirements for @otherprops                                                                  | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201009/msg00001.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita-comment/201009/msg00001.html</a> | Eliot          | ✓ | Updated condproc.dita per comment.                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                           |
| C033 | 8 Sept 2010    | Chris Nitchie   | (TC) Bugs in L&T schemas                                                                                   | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00035.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00035.html</a>                 | Sirois         | ✓ |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                           |
| C034 | 14 Sept 2010   | Kimber          | (TC) @processing-role                                                                                      | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00056.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00056.html</a>                 | Eliot          | ✓ |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                           |
| C035 | 14 Sept 2010   | Kimber          | (TC) XSD constraints                                                                                       | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00053.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00053.html</a>                 | Eliot          | ✓ | Added naming rule for intermediate files per comment.                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                           |
| C036 | 14 Sept 2010   | Tarun Garg      | (TC) Understanding Public ID using '1.0'                                                                   | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00051.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00051.html</a>                 | Robert         | ✓ | Clarify meaning of 1.n, 1.x, etc. In appendix 5.9                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                           |
| C036 | 21 Sept 2010   | Kimber          | (TC) Missing paragraphs on attribute specialization                                                        | <a href="http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00081.html">http://lists.oasis-open.org/archives/dita/201009/msg00081.html</a>                 | Eliot          | ✓ | Incorporated original content, edited for consistency with 1.2 spec                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                           |

PublicReview1Comments (last edited 2010-09-28 00:12:00 by  kriseberlein)